

GOVERNMENT OF INDIA

फाइल सं०  
File No.

C/551/8/80-JP

खण्ड  
Volume

विभाग  
Ministry of

External Affairs

Department  
Office

East Asia Division  
SECTION

टिप्पणियां/पत्राचार  
NOTES/CORRESPONDENCE

4-11

को सूचीकृत की गई  
Indexed on

आद्यक्षर  
Initials

विषय  
Subject

Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose - Papers  
regarding Return of Ashes to India from Japan.

रिकॉर्ड क/ख  
Record A/B

अभिलेख ग में नष्ट की जाए  
Record C. Destroy in

अनुभागीय नोट बुक में नोट किया जाए  
अनुभागीय नोट बुक में नोट न किया जाए

नोट नोट In Sectional Note Book

अनु० अ०/अधीक्षक के आद्यक्षर  
Initials of S. O./Supdt.

लिपिक के आद्यक्षर  
Initials of Clerk

P. S. Sharma  
अनुभाग अधिकारी (ई.ए.)  
Section Officer (EA)  
विदेश मंत्रालय, नई दिल्ली  
Ministry of External Affairs  
New Delhi

पिछले हवाले  
Previous References

C/125/17/78-JP

SCANNED

32726

Record to

Return till 1995

1000

See

16/2/1995

DECLASSIFIED

बाद के हवाले  
Later References

एस० 97 (अविरंजनाय)/आ० ए०ड ए००-58  
S. 97 (Unbleached)/O. & M-58.

प्रभासमुठक-105-19 जनरल एडमिन/73-74-भासमुठक-(सी-96)-12-2-76-50,00,000.  
MGIPTC-105-19 General Adm./73-74-GIPTC-(C-96)-12-2-76-50,00,000.

(गौतम गुप्ता)  
(GAUTAM GUPTA)  
उप सचिव (ए ए अर एम.)  
Dy. Secretary (A. E. A. M.)  
विदेश मंत्रालय, नई दिल्ली  
Ministry of External Affairs  
New Delhi



Secret

Ministry of External Affairs  
(East Asia Division)

Placed below is a letter from Mr. Tatsuo Hayashida, a former Japanese Army officer, to the Prime Minister. Mr. Tatsuo Hayashida mentions that he escorted the ashes of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose from Taipei to Tokyo and pleads that arrangements may please be made for the return of the ashes to India. PM has noted: "I agree but the Forward Bloc will oppose vehemently and others may join".

2. Secretary (East) is fully aware of the background to this problem. Some years ago all papers relating to this problem were transferred to the Ministry of Home Affairs and they handle all Parliamentary questions etc. on the subject.

3. When we were in Tokyo recently the Embassy officials pointed out that the problem has taken a new dimension arising from the fact that all people in Japan who venerated Netaji and are looking after the ashes are now very old. While the priest in the temple may be happy to continue receiving subsidy from the Government of India for maintaining the ashes, it may become progressively more difficult to do this in a manner befitting Netaji.

*veer*  
(V.C. Khanna)  
Director (EA)  
15.7.80

Secretary (East)

*Recd. disc.*  
*16/7/77*  
*on 5/8/77*  
Letter returned to PM's office  
Pl. Discuss

*15/8/77*  
*18/7*  
*15/8*  
*18/7*  
*15/8*  
Wg. Pl. resubmitted with Sept  
*15/8*

*15/8*  
*18/7*  
*15/8*  
Resubmitted. A self explanatory note on the subject, prepared in MHA in December 1978 in connection with a Rajya Sabha question, is at Plat X.

DS (EA) 15/8/80  
Dir (EA)

DS Chund  
15.8.80

Pl. sp  
17/8

4161 Secy (East) 15/7  
Dated...

52/Dir (EA) 80  
16/7

\* the son

388-us(m) 80  
19/7

8616/EA 80  
3/9

1119/EA 80 15/9  
767-us 80-80  
16/9

12.8.80

Put up please.  
12/9/80

52



11805/EA/80

2357/Dir(EA)/80  
SECRETARY, 17/11  
MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS  
NEW DELHI

26/11

6671

17/11

R

Fr. had suggested that  
question might be informally  
discussed with some concerned  
M.L.s before we took this  
any further.  
2. He says it may be better to  
wait for another 3-4 weeks and  
see the mood of Parliament. We  
may raise this again around 17/12

4.  
17/11

Dir (EA) Pl. sp  
ue

DS/EA

Pl for 15 Dec 80.

SM

568/DS(EA)/80  
No. 1029-143/JX-80  
24/11

US (FKN)  
On 14/11  
R K 24/11

1600/EA/87  
18/12

Reference above.

2. Secretary(East) had suggested that this matter could be raised again after 15th December. Relevant papers pertaining to the question of Netaji's ashes are placed below.

SSG

(S.S.Gill)  
Deputy Secretary(EA)  
24.12.80

Dir(EA)

Discussed with  
DS (EA) Pl. passing  
on 10-3-81  
R K 18/12

I have discussed this with Sec(E)  
We can keep pending for the moment.  
The intention was for 24 to discuss  
the matter with the members of the  
Consultative Committee at 1st Dec't meeting.  
How we will work.

27/12

DS

US (FKN)

R K 25/12



Ministry of E.A.  
East Asia Div.

US(S) wished to see these  
papers.

2. The Rajya Sabha Eveshi  
and the Note for Supplementaries  
prepared by MHA, about which  
I spoke to US(S), are at Flag  
X.

3. We shall be grateful if  
the file is returned as urgently.

G. Chaudhary

15.4.81  
US(JMA)

~~US(S)~~

JS(S) may pl. see the Note for  
Supplementaries at 'X'.

G. Chaudhary

15/4

seen; thanks.

US(S)

US(JMA)

G. Chaudhary  
16/4

15/4

3328/EA/81  
20/5

20/4-49-06  
15/4

Dt. No. 2170 ITS (S) 81  
Dated 15.4.81.

12 pages  
on 1.5.81



Reference notes on Page 2 ante  
 pertaining to the bringing of Netaji's ashes  
 from Japan to India, JSC(EA) has recorded  
 that, after discussions with Secy (E), the  
 matter is to be brought up possibly at the  
 time of the next Consultative Committee meeting,  
 when FM would like ~~the~~ to discuss the  
 matter with the members.

Secy (E) may like to see as to  
 whether it could be discussed at the  
 meeting scheduled for 13-14 July at Hyderabad.

*[Signature]*  
 JSC(EA)  
 13/7

Secy (East)

I mentioned this to FM. He  
 said it could wait a little longer

He  
 13/7

*[Signature]*

It return in Section and put again before  
 next Consultative Committee meeting.

*[Signature]*

*[Signature]*

4367  
 10/8/58  
 18/8/58

6206 / EAD/81  
*[Signature]*

ML 12  
 11/10/58



2  
SECRET

POSITION IN THE  
ADMITTED LIST

STARRED QUESTION NO. 468  
IN THE RAJYA SABHA FOR 21.12.78

NOTE FOR SUPPLEMENTARIES

The question reads as under:-

- (a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to a news item which appeared in the Times of India of the 5th December, 1978 regarding the suggestion made by a retired General of the Japanese Imperial Army, who is the custodian of the ashes of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose, to the effect that the ashes should be handed over to the Government of India; and
- (b) if so, whether the Government of India propose to take up the matter with the Government of Japan?

1. The news item referred to in the question is annexed. It refers to the suggestion made by General Fujwara custodian of the ashes said to be of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose stored in the Renkoji Shrine near Tokyo. The statement was reportedly made to a Malaysian lawyer, connected with the Ex-INA personnel in Malaysia. The circumstances in which the statement was made and released to the Press are not known.

2. In April, 1956, the Government of India, in response to public demand, appointed an Inquiry Committee consisting of Sarvashri Shah Nawaz Khan, Suresh Chandra Bose (elder brother of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose) and S.N. Maitra,

Contd.....2..



formerly Chief Commissioner of Andaman and Nicobar, to ascertain the circumstances concerning Netaji's alleged death in an air-crash. Two members of the Committee, namely, Sarvashri Shah Nawaz Khan and S.N.Maitra, came to the conclusion that Netaji met his death in an air-crash at Taihoku (Formosa) on the 18th August, 1945. Shri Suresh Chandra Bose disagreed with these findings and submitted a dissenting report. The majority report was accepted by the Government.

3. The controversy over the disappearance of Netaji was, however, not resolved and demands continued to be made for undertaking another inquiry into the matter. Rumours about Netaji's survival and his subsequent appearance elsewhere cropped up repeatedly. In response to a demand for a fresh inquiry by a number of Members of Parliament belonging to different political parties, the Government decided to appoint a Commission of Inquiry to go into the entire matter in July, 1970. Shri G.D.Khosla, retired Chief Justice of Punjab High Court, was appointed as a one man Commission to "inquire into all the facts and circumstances relating to the disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose in 1945 and the subsequent developments

Contd.....3..



connected therewith and make a report to the Central Government". The Commission visited Japan, Burma, Thailand, Singapore, Malaysia, South Vietnam and Formosa (Taiwan) and examined 224 witnesses including 100 who were examined abroad. A large number of files and documents were produced and cited in evidence. The Commission submitted its report on the 30th June, 1974. The Commission arrived at the same conclusion that was reached by the Shah Nawaz Khan Committee in 1956 that Netaji died in an air-crash at Taihoku on the 18th August, 1945.

4. The Cabinet accepted the finding that Netaji had died in an air-crash on the 18th August, 1945 at Taihoku in Taiwan. The report of the Commission alongwith the memorandum of action taken thereon was laid on the Tables of both the Houses of Parliament on 3rd September, 1974.

5. The Khosla Commission in its Report had mentioned that

"(xviii) Two days later, Bose's body was cremated and his ashes were carried to Tokyo in the beginning of September, 1945 where they were deposited in the Renkoji Temple".

6. The Commission did not make any specific recommendation or suggestions for bringing the ashes to India and it was not also a point of reference to the Commission. While submitting the Report for approval

Contd....4...



of the Cabinet before placing it in Parliament, a point was raised that the Government might have to take a stand on the question of bringing the ashes to India this it was not pursued.

7. The controversy did not, however, end with the publication of the Khosla Commission Report. On the 3rd August, 1977, Shri Samar Guha moved a motion in the Lok Sabha suggesting inter-alia the setting up a three-man Commission for conducting a fresh inquiry into the mystery of disappearance of Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.

8. The motion was discussed at length in 1977 and also in 1978. On the 28th August, 1978 the Prime Minister intervening in the debate observed

"There have been two enquiries into the report of the death of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in the air-crash on 18th August, 1945 at Taihoku airfield during his air-journey to Manchuria, one by a Committee presided over by Maj. General Shah Nawaz Khan and the second by a one-man Commission of Inquiry headed by Shri G.D.Khosla, retired Judge of the Punjab High Court. The majority report of the first Committee and Shri Khosla held the report of the death as true. Since then, reasonable doubts have been cast on the correctness of the conclusions reached in the two reports and various important contradictions in the testimony of witnesses have been noticed. Some further contemporary official documentary records have also become available. In the light

Contd....5..



of those doubts and contradictions and those records Government find it difficult to accept that the earlier conclusions are decisive. At the same time Government feels that no useful purpose would be served by having any further inquiry. I hope that in the light of this statement my hon. friend will withdraw his motion".

Thereafter Prof. Guha withdrew his motion. While doing so he declared in the House

"Today, I cannot express my gratitude to the Prime Minister because today ends a crusade that in my humble way I was trying to conduct on behalf of the people of India at least to see that officially and legally Netaji is not declared dead".

9. The authenticity of the ashes kept in the Renkoji Temple in Japan as those of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose has not therefore been finally established. It will be rather premature to think of receiving the ashes in India and build a suitable memorial for storing them at this stage. This Question can be considered only after the mystery surrounding the disappearance of Netaji in 1945 is finally cleared. As indicated by Prime Minister in the House the Government do not at present contemplate any fresh inquiry into this matter.

Contd.....6..



10. Indian Embassy, Tokyo have reported to the Ministry of External Affairs that as far as the Embassy officials are aware FUJIWARA has not made any such statements in Japan. He is also not the custodian of Netaji's ashes which are kept in Renkoji Shrine in Japan. A Malaysian citizen Karam Singh Veeria visited Japan in October 1978 and met FUJIWARA. He is reported to be of doubtful antecedents and despite his claims has no known links with INA. The Embassy has reported that the statements referred to in the press report have presumably been made by him. The Embassy has also reported that some Japanese associated with INA have privately expressed the desire to see Netaji's ashes ultimately returned to India and FUJIWARA may be one of them.



8

ANNEXURE

"Netaji's Ashes Must Be Given to India"

KUALALUMPUR Dec. 4 - General Fujiwara of the Japanese Imperial Army, custodian of the ashes of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose, has suggested that the ashes should be ceremoniously handed over to the Indian Government reports PTI.

The ageing General expressed this wish to a Malaysian lawyer, Mr. V. Karan Singh who went to Japan recently to pay homage to the Netaji memorial.

He went there on behalf of the ex-INA personnel in Malaysia and Singapore.

Netaji's ashes are kept in an urn at the Renkoji shrine near Tokyo under the care of the chief monk, Matsusuki, for the past 35 years.



11805/EAR/50  
26/11/4

MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS  
(EAST ASIA DIVISION)

-

Netaji's Ashes.

The Note for Supplementaries prepared by the Ministry of Home Affairs in response to a Rajya Sabha Question in December 1978 which gives the background to the Question is placed below.

2. In summary, following is the position :-

- (i) The Government had in 1974 accepted the conclusion reached by the Khosla Commission that Netaji had died in an air crash in Taiwan on 18th August 1945.
- (ii) The Commission had also mentioned that Netaji's body was cremated two days later and was carried to Tokyo in the beginning of September 1945 where they were deposited in the Renkoji temple.
- (iii) However, the Khosla Commission had made no specific recommendation or suggestion for bringing the ashes to India.
- (iv) The then Prime Minister, Shri Morarji Desai, in response to a Motion moved in Lok Sabha by Shri Samar Guha on 20th August 1978 declared that in the light of doubts and contradictions the Government find it difficult to accept that the earlier conclusions (the report of the two Inquiry Commissions headed respectively by Shah Nawaz Khan and Justice Khosla) are decisive. The implication of that was that the authenticity of the ashes kept in Renkoji temple was, once again, brought into question.

3. Both the temple authorities and various admirers of Netaji in Japan have been urging the Indian Government to have the ashes brought back to India. The various people involved in this in Japan are now very old and fear that after their departure from the scene, it may be difficult to ensure that due honour is done to Netaji's ashes.

4. For F.M.'s information only: We give annually about Rs. 20,000 to the temple authorities to enable them to continue to look after the ashes. All matters pertaining to Netaji's death are now dealt with by Ministry of Home Affairs.



-3-

216

Netaji's Ashes

In summary, following is the position:

- i) The Government had in 1974 accepted the conclusion reached by the Khosla Commission that Netaji had died in an air crash in Taiwan on 18th August 1945.
- ii) The Commission had also mentioned that Netaji's body was cremated two days later and was carried to Tokyo in the beginning of September 1945 where they were deposited in the Renkoji temple.
- iii) However, the Khosla Commission had made no specific recommendation or suggestion for bringing the ashes to India.
- iv) The then Prime Minister, Shri Morarji Desai, in response to a Motion moved in Lok Sabha by Shri Samar Guha on 20th August 1978 declared that in the light of doubts and contradictions the Government find it difficult to accept that the earlier conclusions (the report of the two Inquiry Commissions headed respectively by Shahnawaz Khan and Justice Khosla) are decisive. The implication of that was that the authenticity of the ashes kept in Renkoji temple was, once again, brought into question.

2. Both the temple authorities and various admirers of Netaji in Japan have been urging the Indian Government to have the ashes brought back to India. The various people involved in this in Japan are now very old and fear that after their departure from the scene, it may be difficult to ensure that due honour is done to Netaji's ashes.

3. When this had been placed before FM, he had suggested that it might be desirable to have some informal consultation with Members of Parliament. Perhaps the meeting of the Consultative Committee might possibly provide an opportunity for this.



(11)

Netaji's Ashes

In summary, following is the position:

- i) The Government had in 1974 accepted the conclusion reached by the Khosla Commission that Netaji had died in an air crash in Taiwan on 18th August 1945.
- ii) The Commission had also mentioned that Netaji's body was cremated two days later and was carried to Tokyo in the beginning of September 1945 where they were deposited in the Renkoji temple.
- iii) However, the Khosla Commission had made no specific recommendation or suggestion for bringing the ashes to India.
- iv) The then Prime Minister, Shri Morarji Desai, in response to a Motion moved in Lok Sabha by Shri Samar Guha on 20th August 1978 declared that in the light of doubts and contradictions the Government find it difficult to accept that the earlier conclusions (the report of the two Inquiry Commissions headed respectively by Shahnawaz Khan and Justice Khosla) are decisive. The implication of that was that the authenticity of the ashes kept in Renkoji temple was, once again, brought into question.

2. Both the temple authorities and various admirers of Netaji in Japan have been urging the Indian Government to have the ashes brought back to India. The various people involved in this in Japan are now very old and fear that after their departure from the scene, it may be difficult to ensure that due honour is done to Netaji's ashes.

3. When this had been placed before FM, he had suggested that it might be desirable to have some informal consultation with Members of Parliament. Perhaps the meeting of the Consultative Committee might possibly provide an opportunity for this.